

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE NINTH CIRCUIT

# 22,754

CECIL R. REED

Appellant.

vs.  
STEWART L. UDALL, Secretary of the Department of the Interior of the United States, and individually; J. R. PENNY, Nevada State Director, Bureau of Land Management, U.S. Department of the Interior, and individually; and VAL B. RICHMAN, District Manager, Carson City Office, Bureau of Land Management, U.S. Department of the Interior, and individually.

Appellee.

Just the  
Opinion  
and  
Order  
FILED  
APR 20 1968  
U.S. DISTRICT COURT  
CLERK'S OFFICE  
NEVADA

APPEAL FROM THE DISTRICT COURT  
OF THE UNITED STATES FOR THE  
DISTRICT OF NEVADA

BRIEF FOR THE APPELLANT

GEORGE W. ABBOTT  
First National Bank Bldg.  
Minden, Nevada 89423

Attorney for Appellant

CLYDE O. MARTZ  
Assistant Attorney General

FRANK B. FREIDMAN  
A. DONALD MILEUR  
Attorneys  
Department of Justice  
Washington, D. C. 20530

Attorneys for Appellees



SUBJECT INDEXPAGES

I.	<u>TABLE OF AUTHORITIES</u> .....	iv-v
1.	Court decisions cited, referred.....	iii
2.	Administrative decisions cited.....	iii
3.	Statutory, Code, CFR citations.....	iii, iv, v
4.	Index to Exhibits.....	vi, vii, viii, ix
II.	<u>STATEMENT OF PLEADING AND FACTS</u>	
	ESTABLISHING JURISDICTIONAL BASIS.....	2-7
III.	<u>STATEMENT OF THE CASE</u> .....	7-II
1.	Incorporation of Record.....	7-8
2.	Questions Involved, manner raised.....	8-II
IV.	<u>SPECIFICATION OF ERRORS</u> .....	II
V.	<u>ARGUMENT</u> .....	II-27
1.	Summary of Appellant's Position.....	II, 12
2.	The proof of compliance tendered by the entryman in the instant case is as fully corroborated as is required and contemplated by the applicable law, and the entryman is entitled to issuance of a patent to his full 160-acre entry.....	12
(a)	Basic Homestead Law.....	13
(b)	Military Service Credit.....	13
(c)	Statutory Provisions for Final Proof...	13-14
(d)	Departmental Regulations: Final Proof	14-15
(e)	Regulations Controlling Government Contests.....	15-16



SUBJECT INDEX (cont.)

	PAGE
V. ARGUMENT (cont.)	
(f) The Secretary's Decision and Conclusion of the United States District Court .....	16-19
(g) Appellant's Response.....	19-24
3. On the whole record, appellant-entryman is entitled to have his final proof allowed, when tested by "good faith" standards on both a legal and equitable basis.....	24-25
VI. CONCLUSION .....	27



## I. TABLE OF AUTHORITIES

### 1. Court Decisions Cited, Referred.

<u>CASE</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
Ard v. Brandon, 156 U. S. 537.....	25, 26
Carr v. File, 44 F. 713 .....	24
Clements v. Warner, 24 How. 294, 16 L. Ed. 995..	25
Foster v. Seaton, 271 F. 2d 83.....	17
Gavanaugh v. Wilson, 70 N. Y. 177, Atl. ....	21
Quock Ting v. U. S. 140 U. S. 417.....	18, 21
Stewart v. Penny, 238 F. Supp. 521.....	9, 17, 24, 25, 26
United States v. George, 228 U. S. 14.....	22, 23
United States v. Verde Copper Co., 196 U. S. 207...	22, 23

### 2. Administrative Decisions Cited, Referred.

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
U. S. v. Cecil Reed, Nevada 3296 (Dec. 12, 1963) Hearing Examiner, Admin. File.....	3, 15
U. S. v. Cecil Reed, Nevada 034275 (July 7, 1964) BLM Director, Admin. File.....	4
U. S. V. Cecil Reed, A-30354 (Sept. 29, 1965) Interior Dept. Decision, Admin. File.....	4, 21

### 3. Statutory, Code, CFR Provisions Cited, Referred

<u>CITATION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
R. S. 2478.....	16, 22
R. S. 2246.....	22, 23



TABLE OF AUTHORITIES / cont. /

<u>CITATION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>U. S.</u> 2201.....	9, 10, 13, 19, 22, 23
<u>Stat.</u> 20, p. 472.....	14, 15, 31
<u>U. S. Comp. St.</u> , sec. 2246, 1904, p. 1371, .....	22
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 5, sec. 1001.....	3
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 5, sec. 100 (c).....	17
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 5, sec. 1009.....	3
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 10, sec. 1001.....	19
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 20, sec. 1291.....	7
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 20, sec. 1391(e).....	5
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 28, sec. 13(1).....	3
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 33, sec. 75.....	22
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 101-164.....	2, 8, 9, 10, 13, 19, 21, 22, 24
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 251.....	13, 14, 15
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 252.....	13, 14
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 254.....	14
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 279.....	8, 13
<u>USCA</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1201.....	16, 22
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, Part 221 (1954 Ed.).....	3, 16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.18 (1954 Ed.).....	24
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.44 (1954 Ed.).....	14, 15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.45 (1954 Ed.).....	15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.7 (1954 Ed.).....	15



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
TABLE OF AUTHORITIES (cont.)3. Statutory, Code, CFR Provisions Cited, Referred (cont.)

<u>CITATION</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 166.50 (1954 Ed).....	14, 15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.1 to 221.107 (1954 Ed)...	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.67 (1954 Ed).....	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 221.74(a) (1954 Ed).....	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, Part 1840 (1968 Rev.).....	3
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1844.9 (1964 Supp.).....	4
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1852.2 (1968 Rev.).....	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 1852.3-6 (2) (1968 Rev.)...	16
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 2211.1-4(a)(1)(1968 Rev.)....	15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 2211.1-4(c)(1)(1968 Rev)..	15
<u>CFR</u> , Tit. 43, sec. 2211.1-4(d)(2) (1968 Rev.)...	15

4. Federal Publications, Miscellaneous.

<u>DOCUMENT</u>	<u>PAGE</u>
<u>Federal Register</u> , Vol. 29, 4326.....	3



INDEX TO EXHIBITS

	FOR THE APPELLANT	<u>Per Ident.</u>	<u>In Evidence</u>
4	A Photograph . . . . .	8	13
5	B Photograph . . . . .	8	13
6	C Photograph . . . . .	8	13
7	D Photograph . . . . .	8	13
8	E Application for Homestead Entry, dated April 15, 1955 . . . . .		13
9	F Designation of Land Classification and Application Allowed, dated April 29, 1957 . . . . .		13
10	G Notice of Intention to Make Proof, dated November 18, 1958 . . . . .		13
11	G-1 Document entitled "Homestead Entry Final Proof, Testimony of Claimant" . . . . .		13
12	H Rejection of 1958 Application . . . . .		13
13	I Notice of Intention to Make Proof, dated March 8, 1961 . . . . .		13
14	J Form 4-327, dated March 13, 1961, addressed to Cecil R. Reed, entitled "Instructions for Publication," together with Form 4-348b, dated March 13, 1961, entitled "Notice for Publication, Final Proof" . . . . .		13
15	K Final Proof Submission, dated May 11, 1961 . . . . .		13
16	L Memorandum to Land Office Manager, dated January 26, 1962, from Chief, Division of Land & Minerals, signed by Lewis Chichester, together with attachments . . . . .		13
17	M Letter dated March 1, 1962, addressed to Mr. Cecil R. Reed, signed by R. M. Zundel . . . . .		13
18	N Letter dated March 12, 1962, addressed to President John F. Kennedy, signed by Cecil R. Reed . . . . .		13



## INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Cont'd)

FOR THE APPELLANT

<u>For Ident.</u>	<u>In Evidence</u>
-----------------------	------------------------

O Carbon copy of letter dated March 27, 1962, addressed to Cecil R. Reed, bearing the typewritten signature of Richard J. McCormick, Chief, Branch of Land Appeals, Division of Appeals . . . . . 13

P Letter dated March 30, 1962, addressed to U. S. Department of the Interior, attention of R. M. Zundel, Lands Adjudication Section, signed by John Chrislaw, attorney at law, Gardnerville, Nevada . . . . . 13

Q Memorandum dated April 3, 1962 to Lands Office Manager, from Chief, Division of Lands & Minerals . . . . . 13

R Letter dated April 6, 1962, addressed to Mr. H. Curt Hammit, signed by George W. Abbott, Attorney at Law, Gardnerville, Nevada . . . . . 13

S Letter dated April 7, 1962, addressed to Mr. H. Curt Hammit, signed by George W. Abbott, Attorney at Law, Gardnerville, Nevada . . . . . 13

T Carbon copy of letter dated April 9, 1962, addressed to Mr. George W. Abbott, bearing the typewritten signature of J. R. Penny . . . . . 13

U Carbon copy of letter dated April 17, 1962, addressed to Mr. Cecil R. Reed, bearing the typewritten signature of Richard J. McCormick . . . . . 13

V Complaint filed by the United States of America, dated April 18, 1962 . . . . . 13

W Motion to Dismiss Complaint and for a More Definite Statement, dated May 21, 1962 . . . . . 13

X Affidavit in Support of Motion to Dismiss Complaint or for a More Definite Statement . . . . . 13

Y Answer on Behalf of Contestee, dated May 21, 1962 . . . . . 13

Z Order of Hearing Examiner, dated June 26, 1962 . . . . . 13



## INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Cont'd)

FOR THE APPELLANT

<u>Exhibit</u>	<u>Ident.</u>	<u>In Evidence</u>
----------------	---------------	--------------------

AA Undated document of the United States as Contestant, entitled "Bill of Particulars," together with affidavit . . . . .		13
BB Letter dated July 5, 1962, from Abbott to Hearing Examiner . . . . .		13
CC Letter dated July 25, 1962 from Hearing Examiner to Abbott . . . . .		13
DD Letter of Abbott dated August 1, 1962 . . . . .		13
EE August 13, 1962 ruling of Hearing Examiner denying motion to dismiss and motion for more definite statement . . . . .		13
FF Carbon copy of letter dated October 15, 1962, addressed to Cecil R. Reed, bearing the typewritten signature of J. R. Penny . . . . .		13
GG Notice of Hearing, dated May 6, 1963 . . . . .		13
HH Form 4-274 entitled "Application for Desert-Land Entry" . . . . .		46
II Form 4-007 entitled "Application for Homestead Entry" . . . . .		46
JJ Document entitled "Well Log and Report to the State Engineer of Nevada," dated October 17, 1960 . . . . .		62

FOR THE APPELLEE

1 Map or plat delineating boundaries and location of Homestead Entry Nevada 034275, by James S. Hagihara, June 19, 1963 . . . . .	7	14
2 Photograph . . . . .	8	14
3 Three photographs . . . . .	8	14
4 Photograph . . . . .	8	14



1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26

INDEX TO EXHIBITS (Cont'd)

FOR THE APPELLEE:

		For Ident.	In Evidence
5	Document entitled "Pumping Water for Irrigation" . . . . .		36
6.	Document entitled "Well Log and Report to the State Engineer of Nevada," dated January 16, 1961 . . . . .		38

